



UNITED STATES NATIONAL COMMITTEE
OF THE
COMMISSION INTERNATIONALE DE L'ECLAIRAGE
(INTERNATIONAL COMMISSION ON ILLUMINATION)

DAVID L. MacADAM, Chairman
Technical Committee 1.3 Colorimetry
68 HAMMOND ST
ROCHESTER NY 14615

November 8, 1976

Mr. Rolf Kuehni
Verona Dyestuff Division
Mobay Chemical Corporation
Union, New Jersey 07083

Dear Rolf:

Thank you for your letter of October 14 concerning the USNC meeting.

I think that the action of the Executive Committee closes the matter. I don't think that either of the formulas approved will be significantly changed by the CIE before the turn of the century, no matter what work is done or what results are obtained. Most of the support for the recommendation, in this country and abroad, was by people who demanded a formula that will not be changed, for any reason, once recommended. The deal by which two formulas were included, neither being very good, satisfied the demand for immediate and final action. I am sure that the 1976 formulas will not be replaced by the CIE for decades, if ever.

For a precedent, the V_λ curve that was "provisionally" recommended by the CIE in 1924 has never been revised, despite the fact that large errors in it (e.g., 300% at 400 nm) were demonstrated before 1947. Because it was built into the 1931 standard observer ($\bar{y} = V_\lambda$), Dr. Judd tried to get it corrected in 1955. His effort failed. I understand that Dr. Kinney is repeating that effort. I predict that it will fail again.

If CIE recommendations were not so demonstrably incorrigible, I would favor your working program to develop a better formula for color difference. As it is, however, I am convinced of the futility of any effort, no matter how well conceived, or how vigorously pursued, to change the 1976 formulas for color difference. I have too many things that I would rather do, which have greater promise of accomplishment.

I am sorry to be so discouraging. Some battles are decisive. In the CIE, a position once won is impregnable.

Sincerely,

David L. MacAdam